

Animals as Food: Armstrong Part 4—DeGrazia, Grandin, Appleby, AAA

David DeGrazia, “Meat Eating”: the story of “hen x”, “hog y”, and “cow z”

- What kind of welfare problems does DeGrazia describe in intensive confinement systems? How are these different from the welfare problems of extensive systems?
- not all 'factory-farmed' meat is created equal, welfare-wise... Which is better? Which is worse? Why?
- How might DeGrazia's dichotomy between '**factory farms**' and '**traditional family farms**' be problematic?
- “Many fish today are raised in fish farms... When fish are raised in this way, the case for boycotting these products is stronger.” Why might this not necessarily be true?

Temple Grandin, “Thinking Like Animals” and “A Major Change”

- What are some of the details that farm animals (cows, in this case) would notice that ‘normal’ humans would ignore?
- “By the end of 1999, 90 percent of beef plants were stunning 95 percent of the cattle they processed with one shot: 37 percent were stunning 99 percent to 100 percent with one shot.” While this is definitely a laudable improvement, keep in mind that 5 percent of a few hundred million is still five million!
- What are the benefits of using a checklist/yes-or-no scoring system to evaluate slaughterhouse practices?
- While slaughter conditions have improved, Grandin says that transport conditions have in many cases gotten worse—given the nature of modern economics/business, why might transport present ethical problems?
- “One of my biggest concerns is the possibility that producers are pushing animals beyond their biological limits.”
- “Large meat-buying customers such as fast-food restaurants in the United States and supermarket chains in the United Kingdom can motivate great change...”

Michael C. Appleby, “Food Prices and Animal Welfare” [see chart on 233]

- From 1/3-1/2 of a 1945 family's income on food down to around 10% today—how did this happen??
 - A broiler chicken from \$50-\$3, and “in supermarkets in many countries, milk is cheaper than water”
- “most consumers already pay more than necessary, by buying specialist products, convenience foods, or ready-cooked meals [on the **value-added** component of the **food supply chain**]
 - Only around 20% of your supermarket purchases go to farmers. Thus, Appleby's argument goes, increasing livestock farmer costs by 10% only increases the price of a meal by 0.5%
- The Brambell Report and the **Five Freedoms**
- Animal welfare as a combination of: **biological functioning**, **natural living**, and **affective states**
- Two different kinds of ‘solutions’: 1) creating a level playing field (the European model), and 2) allowing for niche markets via **ecolabels** (the American model)

Animal Ag Alliance, “Animal Agriculture: Myths and Facts”

- What does it mean to say that “we understand the difference between what an animal may want and what it needs?”
- The AAA is right to point out that most of the country's (then) 2.2 million farms are, in fact, family owned—the 7,000 that are not, however, are really, really big... [as an aside: the definition of precisely what constitutes a farm is an interesting one, and the USDA changes it around every now and again]
- What does AAA point to as the benefits of indoor housing systems? (237) How does they explain the confinement/crating/caging of animals?
- How does the AAA respond to the ‘myth’ that “animals are routinely “mutilated” by **beak trimming**, **tail docking**, **branding**, **dehorning**, **castration**, and other practices”? (239) Are you convinced?
- On **antibiotics**: “there is no conclusive scientific proof that the use of human antibiotics in animals... is a risk to human health” (note the extremely cautious language here...). While it's true that “animals kept in housing are no more likely to get sick than animals kept in the open” as a general rule, the question of **stocking density** does change matters.