# Companion Animal Class Notes: Rollin, Serpell et al, Palmer

- breed-specific legislation
- hoarding
- 'no kill' vs. 'open admission' shelters and the question of 'convenience euthanasia'
- 'pets and companions', 'guardians and owners'
- Feral dogs and cats (and spay and neuter programs)
- Cat-wildlife conflicts (and declawing—or

**devocalizing** in dogs)

- Animal relinquishment
- Puppy mills and 'exotic pets'
- Issues in equine welfare
- other issues?

#### Some general questions

- How much, if at all, should the government be able to intervene in how people treat 'their' animals? (or, to use Rollin's language, what should be included in the 'social ethic' and what should be kept in the 'personal ethic')
- Do you think, with Rollin, that people should demonstrate their fitness to be animal owners/guardians?
- [Re. link on China and live skinning of dogs for fur] Should governments be allowed to ban goods from foreign markets on animal welfare grounds? On environmental grounds? On human rights grounds? (etc...)

### Bernie Rollin and Michael Rollin., "Dogmaticisms and Catechisms: Ethics and Companion Animals"

- "We acquire these animals while knowing nothing of their needs and natures, then get rid of them because they cannot help those needs and natures." Do "we have a contractual relationship with all domestic animals"?
  - *Telos* and *philia* in Aristotle and Rollin
- "Many find nothing problematic in crating a dog all day, while we profess to abhor the crating of veal calves."
- "In New York City, only people with dogs (or babies) get to talk to strangers without suspicion" (social capital)
- "Just because we are over-regulated in some areas in a paternalistic way does not mean we are sufficiently regulated in others". Is this a fair claim? Who gets to decide what should be regulated, and shouldn't?
- What does Rollin mean when he talks about being "sin eaters"?

## James Serpell et al, "The Welfare of Assistance and Therapy Animals"

- what are some different examples of animal assisted therapy? How might they be ethically problematic when considered from the perspective of the animal?
  - failing to provide for animals' needs
  - selecting or breeding animals for assistance
  - failure to take account of developmental events
- Using inappropriate training methods
- Use of badly designed equipment or facilities
- End-user problems

### Clare Palmer, "Killing Animals in Animal Shelters"

• Palmer's essay presents two views on the "painless killing of healthy animals". We will revisit the killing/letting suffer distinction in ethics when we discuss **utilitarianism** (and **consequentialism**) and **deontology** (as well as Palmer's preferred **relational** view) in greater detai

What 3 defenses of humane killing does Palmer present? (571)

- Why does **Tom Regan** argue that "the killing of healthy animals in animals shelters should not be regarded as euthanasia"? Do you agree?
- Do you agree that "there seems to be something troubling about both [the utilitarian and consequentialist] positions, taken alone?"
- Do you agree with Palmer that the universal drive towards spay/neuter programs harms the richness of the animal's life? Is spay/neuter 'worth it' anyway?

#### (optional, from Kalof) Yi-Fu Tuan, "Animal Pets: Cruelty and Affection"

- on the interlocking role of 'dominance and affection' in 'petmaking' (he focuses on the Asian goldfish as art object for the leisure class), which to Tuan is "an exercise in fantasy, another attempt to bend nature not so much to human needs [as to their] moods."
- How might Tuan distinguish between domestication (which requires domination) and 'mere taming'.
- Domestication, 'exaggerated infantilism', and neoteny
- What does it mean to say that "to some people, a dog's submission to command is desirable in itself."? (148)